

Service Quality and Client Satisfaction in Calamba City Civil Registry

Alexandra V. Carreon

Laguna College of Business and Arts, Calamba City, Laguna, Philippines

Author Email: alexandravcarreon07@gmail.com

Date received: June 7, 2024

Date revised: June 17, 2024

Date accepted: June 22, 2024

Originality: 95%

Grammarly Score: 99%

Similarity: 5%

Recommended citation:

Carreon, A. (2024). Service quality and client satisfaction in Calamba City civil registry. *Journal of Interdisciplinary Perspectives*, 2(8), 99-113. <https://doi.org/10.69569/jip.2024.0272>

Abstract. The study conducted at the Calamba City Civil Registry Office aimed to evaluate service quality and client satisfaction using quantitative methods, focusing on marriage certificate registration and marriage license application services in Calamba City, Laguna, Philippines. The research employed a descriptive correlational design with quota sampling, involving 22 employees, 71 marriage license applicants, and 52 marriage registration clients. Data collection was carried out through a survey instrument with a high reliability (Cronbach's Alpha = 0.790), assessing service quality dimensions such as tangibility, reliability, responsiveness, assurance, empathy, personnel, process, equipment and facilities, and value for money. Statistical analyses included frequency distributions, Likert scale interpretations, t-tests, and Pearson correlation coefficients. Key findings revealed significant differences between employee and client assessments in terms of reliability, responsiveness, and assurance ($p < 0.05$), whereas tangibility and empathy showed no significant differences. Additionally, a positive relationship was identified between service quality and client satisfaction, with correlation coefficients ranging from 0.25 to 0.60 ($p = 0.000$). These results highlight the importance of enhancing service quality to improve client satisfaction. In conclusion, the study provides valuable insights into specific areas where the Calamba City Civil Registry Office can focus its improvement efforts. The findings suggest that initiatives such as regular staff training, system upgrades, fee transparency, quality control measures, and a one-stop-shop approach are crucial for enhancing service delivery and increasing client satisfaction. These conclusions are significant for policymakers and managers seeking evidence-based strategies to improve public service quality and client experiences at governmental service centers like civil registry offices.

Keywords: Service quality; Client satisfaction; Government; Civil registry; City of Calamba.

1.0 Introduction

In today's digital age, government services are important for societies. They cover a wide range of responsibilities aimed at improving citizens' lives. The quality of these services is measured by how satisfied people are with them. When services are delivered well, it builds trust and confidence in the government. If services are not good enough, people can get frustrated and lose faith in the government's ability to solve society's problems. Client satisfaction is an important way to measure government services. It shows how responsive, accessible, and good the services are. Satisfied clients are more likely to support government initiatives, creating a cycle of involvement and cooperation.

The Civil Registry is responsible for recording vital events like births, marriages, and deaths, shaping individuals' legal identities. The quality of its services significantly impacts citizens' lives, affecting access to rights and services. However, the institution faces challenges in managing data, navigating legal frameworks, and ensuring privacy. Client satisfaction is crucial, dependent on accessibility, responsiveness, and efficiency. Safety and

security measures, such as encryption and authentication, are essential to protect personal information and maintain the integrity of vital records.

Integrating constitutional provisions with civil registry services is essential for ensuring that the government operates within the bounds of the law and respects citizens' fundamental rights. Privacy, non-discrimination, and access to essential services are crucial principles emphasized in constitutional documents that are particularly relevant to civil registry services. The collection and handling of personal information must adhere to stringent privacy standards to ensure individuals can control their data. Constitutional non-discrimination guarantees contribute to the equitable provision of civil registry services, ensuring that registration processes remain accessible to all citizens, irrespective of their background.

Different countries have varying levels of efficiency and effectiveness in their civil registry services. A well-functioning system prioritizes accuracy, accessibility, and security, recognizing their significant role in individual well-being and broader societal development. Governments are guided by international standards, such as those set by the United Nations, in establishing and maintaining robust civil registry systems. Nordic countries like Sweden, Norway, and Denmark serve as examples of best practices with advanced and efficient systems, emphasizing digitalization, interconnected databases, streamlined processes, and user-friendly interfaces.

Furthermore, Singapore is known for its advanced and technology-driven civil registry practices. The city-state has implemented biometric identification and automated registration processes, making resident experience seamless and secure. Singapore's commitment to technological advancements has improved the efficiency of its civil registry services, setting an example for other nations looking to enhance their systems. (Smith, 2019). However, some developing nations need help improving their civil registry services. African countries face challenges due to limited resources, remote rural populations, and poor infrastructure. International organizations like the United Nations Development Programme (UNDP) are working on initiatives to enhance civil registration processes in these regions. These efforts include training programs, technological support, and sharing knowledge to improve civil registry services in developing nations. (World Bank, 2018).

The Philippines values civil registry services, which handle important records like birth certificates, marriage licenses, and death certificates. However, the quality of these services varies by region, depending on factors like population, income, and resources. In big cities like Manila, digitalization has been used to make it easier to get these records. The National Statistics Office (NSO) has become the Philippine Statistics Authority (PSA), which now accepts applications online. This change to digital services has made it simpler for people to access records and reduced the amount of paperwork they need to do.

Challenges persist in remote and economically disadvantaged areas. Rural communities face obstacles related to infrastructure, awareness, and accessibility. These communities are the most affected due to their limited financial resources and fewer opportunities. Local government units (LGUs) play a crucial role in ensuring that civil registry services are available and tailored to meet the community's unique needs. To address these challenges, LGUs are implementing mobile registration units, community outreach programs, and localized information campaigns to make civil registry services more inclusive. Mobile registration units are crucial in remote areas, while community outreach programs and localized information campaigns help raise awareness about the importance of civil registry services and how to access them.

This study focused on improving government services for citizens, specifically the Calamba City Civil Registry. It emphasized the importance of maintaining accurate records of life events for residents to build trust and facilitate access to government services. The research supported national and international efforts to inform policymaking and development by maintaining accurate vital event records. The research differed from previous studies by focusing on identifying significant differences between two groups of respondents in terms of the manifestation of service quality, specifically in the context of marriage registration and license application in the Civil Registry. The study was conducted with extensive readings and gathered additional information from related literature and studies, which proved to be invaluable in conducting a thorough analysis. This study marked the second instance of a research study aimed at assessing service quality and client satisfaction in the Calamba City Civil

Registry. Unlike previous studies that encompassed a broad range of services, this research specifically honed in on the registration of marriage and application for marriage licenses.

2.0 Methodology

2.1 Research Design

The study used quantitative research methods, specifically descriptive correlational research, to explore the relationship between service quality and client satisfaction at the Calamba City Civil Registry Office. By collecting numerical data from a substantial sample, the study aimed to generalize findings to the entire clientele, utilizing structured questionnaires and survey tools for unbiased data collection. The goal was to provide insights and recommendations for enhancing service quality and supporting policymaking through statistically backed conclusions.

2.2 Research Locale

Conducted in Calamba City, Laguna, Philippines, the research focused on the Civil Registry Office due to its crucial role in managing vital records for residents and businesses. This office handles services such as birth, marriage, and death certificates, making it a pivotal institution for the community. Analyzing client interactions and experiences provided valuable insights for improving service delivery.

2.3 Research Respondents

The study's respondents were clients applying for marriage licenses (49%), clients registering for marriages (36%), and employees (15%). This distribution highlighted the Civil Registry's primary focus on marriage-related documentation and provided insights from different stages of service interaction.

2.4 Research Instrument

A 45-question survey questionnaire based on the ServQual Model and Value Percept Disparity Theory was developed to assess service quality (tangibility, reliability, responsiveness, assurance, empathy) and client satisfaction (personnel, process, equipment and facilities, value for money). The questionnaire was validated by experts and tested for reliability using Cronbach's Alpha, achieving a value of .790.

2.5 Data Gathering Procedure

Data collection involved distributing validated questionnaires to clients and employees at the Civil Registry Office. Permissions were obtained to ensure cooperation, and survey stations were set up for easy access. The data was analyzed using statistical methods, and findings were used to develop an action plan for improving service quality.

2.6 Ethical Consideration

The study adhered to ethical guidelines, ensuring voluntary participation, informed consent, and confidentiality. Participants were fully informed about the research and could withdraw at any time. Data handling complied with the Data Privacy Act of 2012, maintaining the integrity and reliability of the research.

3.0 Results and Discussion

3.1 Service Quality in the City Civil Registry of Calamba

In terms of Tangibility

Tangibility was Fully Manifested (3.83) as to the level of service quality in the City Civil Registry of Calamba. This garnered a standard deviation of 0.31 for the employees and 0.25 for the clients. All indicators were verbally interpreted as Fully Manifested. The indicator "Signage and instructions within the office premises sufficiently guided clients through the registration and application processes" yielded the highest mean score of 3.88. On the other hand, the indicator "Additional amenities or services to enhance the client experience at the office would be appreciated" received the lowest mean score of responses with 3.73.

It implies that both employees and clients are quite satisfied with the clarity and conciseness of the signage and instructions, as they strongly agree that these are effective in guiding them through the registration and application processes. The Anti-Red Tape Authority, also known as ARTA, requires that every office has a citizen charter posted on the bulletin board so that clients are aware of the step-by-step procedures, as well as how long

it takes for every service. This helps to ensure that clients are well-informed and can easily navigate through the process. However, while both employees and clients agree that additional amenities or services will be appreciated, the agreement is not as strong in this regard. There are a few devices that can be used to enhance the client experience. For example, there is a television located outside the office for the clients to use, but only the office programs are displayed on the screen. Unfortunately, not all clients are interested in this.

Table 1. Descriptive statistics of the level of service quality in the City Civil Registry of Calamba in terms of tangibility

Indicators	Employee		Clients		Composite	
	Mean	Interpretation	Mean	Interpretation	Mean	Interpretation
1. The materials and equipment used by the office are of high quality and sufficient for needs.	3.80	FM	3.88	FM	3.84	FM
2. The overall cleanliness and organization of the office premises meet expectations.	3.90	FM	3.71	FM	3.81	FM
3. Signage and instructions within the office premises sufficiently guide clients through the registration and application processes.	3.90	FM	3.86	FM	3.88	FM
4. Waiting areas provided by the office are comfortable and welcoming.	4.00	FM	3.74	FM	3.87	FM
5. Additional amenities or services to enhance the client experience at the office would be appreciated.	3.80	FM	3.65	FM	3.73	FM
Standard Deviation	0.31		0.25			
General Assessment	3.88	FM	3.77	FM	3.83	FM

Legend: 3.25 - 4.00 Strongly Agree – Fully Manifested (FM), 2.50 - 3.24 Agree – Manifested (M), 1.75 - 2.49 Disagree – Slightly Manifested (SM), 1.00 - 1.74 Strongly Disagree – Not Manifested (NM)

Furthermore, students express dissatisfaction with certain areas such as the condition of hostels and equipment on campuses. This highlights the need for additional amenities or services to enhance the overall student experience. The positive association between service tangibility and student satisfaction, as revealed by the study, further supported the implications. This finding emphasizes the importance of improving service tangibility to increase student satisfaction with teaching and learning facilities. The insights provided by Kanori et al. (2020) regarding the importance of service tangibility in higher education institutions shed light on the impact it had on student satisfaction. The study noted that students tended to rely on tangible cues such as learning materials and spaces to evaluate the quality of academic services. This emphasized the significance of providing clear and concise signage and instructions to guide students through registration and application processes.

In terms of Reliability

Table 2. Descriptive statistics of the level of service quality in the City Civil Registry of Calamba in terms of reliability

Indicators	Employee		Clients		Composite	
	Mean	Interpretation	Mean	Interpretation	Mean	Interpretation
1. Employees ensure that there are no errors or delays in the registration of marriage certificates and application for marriage licenses.	3.80	FM	3.68	FM	3.74	FM
2. The office consistently meets promised deadlines.	3.90	FM	3.56	FM	3.73	FM
3. Accuracy of information provided by the office staff regarding necessary documentation and procedures is generally satisfactory.	3.90	FM	3.61	FM	3.76	FM
4. Communication regarding the status of applications is consistently maintained.	3.90	FM	3.59	FM	3.75	FM
5. The office has effective mechanisms in place for handling and resolving client complaints or grievances.	3.80	FM	3.64	FM	3.72	FM
Standard Deviation	0.26		0.31			
General Assessment	3.86	FM	3.62	FM	3.74	FM

Reliability was Fully Manifested (3.74) as to the level of manifestation of service quality in the City Civil Registry of Calamba. This garnered a standard deviation of 0.26 for employees and 0.31 for clients. All indicators were verbally interpreted as Fully Manifested. The indicator “The accuracy of information provided by the office staff regarding necessary documentation and procedures was generally satisfactory” with the highest mean score of 3.76. Moreover, the indicator “The office also had effective mechanisms for handling and resolving client complaints or grievances” got the lowest mean score of 3.72. It implies that both employees and clients fully

manifested the office staff's commendable performance in delivering precise and current information concerning essential documentation and procedures. All guidance provided to clients adheres strictly to the implementing rules, regulations, and memoranda set forth by the Philippine Statistics Authority, guaranteeing the provision of dependable and precise information. When faced with clients' differing viewpoints, employees adeptly manage the situation by furnishing pertinent documents to substantiate the correct procedures.

Furthermore, the office has effective mechanisms in place for handling and resolving client complaints or grievances. Both employees and clients agree that the office staff is responsive and helpful in addressing any issues that may arise. The staff is well-trained in customer service, making the clients feel valued and heard. It is clear that the office staff takes customer satisfaction seriously and strives to provide an excellent customer experience. However, it is unfortunate that there are instances when no staff is assigned to the help desk due to a lack of workforce. This results in delays in addressing client complaints or grievances, leading to frustration and dissatisfaction among clients. The office must take steps to address this issue and ensure that enough staff members are available to handle client inquiries and complaints promptly.

Dam and Dam (2021) provided a theoretical framework that supported the implications drawn from the study. Firstly, the study highlighted the significance of service quality in influencing customer satisfaction and loyalty. It established that providing accurate information and efficient handling of procedures, as demonstrated by the office staff, aligned with the notion of service quality. This connection was crucial because it suggested that the office's efforts to deliver accurate and up-to-date information contributed to customer satisfaction and loyalty. Moreover, the study emphasized the importance of brand image in influencing customer satisfaction and loyalty. By ensuring that the instructions given to clients were based on official regulations and standards, the office maintained a positive brand image. This aligned with the findings of the study, which indicated that a positive brand image led to higher levels of customer satisfaction and loyalty. Additionally, the study discussed the role of customer satisfaction in driving customer loyalty. The effective handling of client complaints and grievances, as noted in the implications, contributed to customer satisfaction. This was supported by the study's findings, which revealed a positive relationship between customer satisfaction and loyalty.

In terms of Responsiveness

Table 3. Descriptive statistics of the level of service quality in the City Civil Registry of Calamba in terms of responsiveness

Indicators	Employee		Clients		Composite	
	Mean	Interpretation	Mean	Interpretation	Mean	Interpretation
1. Inquiries or concerns are promptly addressed by the staff.	4.00	FM	3.76	FM	3.88	FM
2. Staff members are attentive and proactive in assisting with needs.	4.00	FM	3.7	FM	3.85	FM
3. Various channels for contacting the office are readily available.	3.90	FM	3.58	FM	3.74	FM
4. Office staff actively seek feedback and suggestions for improvement.	4.00	FM	3.59	FM	3.80	FM
5. Challenges in accessing or utilizing the office's online services for registration of certificate of marriage and application for marriage license have been minimal.	3.70	FM	3.5	FM	3.60	FM
Standard Deviation	0.26		0.29			
General Assessment	3.92	FM	3.62	FM	3.77	FM

Responsiveness was Fully Manifested (3.77) as to the level of manifestation of service quality in the City Civil Registry of Calamba. All indicators were verbally interpreted as Fully Manifested. This garnered standard deviations of 0.26 and 0.29, respectively. The indicator "The staff quickly responded to inquiries or concerns" got the highest mean score of 3.88. On the other hand, It also appeared that accessing the office's online services to register the certificate of marriage and application for a marriage license had been relatively easy, as indicated by the lowest mean score of responses with 3.60, which was also interpreted as Fully Manifested.

It implies that both employees and clients fully manifested the City Civil Registry Office's apparent possession of a proficient and well-trained staff capable of efficiently managing a range of transactions and inquiries. One factor enabling employees to address inquiries or concerns beyond their designated roles is their requisite understanding

of every transaction process. This ensures seamless transactional continuity even in the absence of specific employees. Moreover, employees demonstrate responsiveness to inquiries or concerns via multiple communication channels including telephone, email, and the Facebook page, thereby enhancing and preserving elevated levels of customer satisfaction and loyalty.

However, despite the office's efforts to simplify the process of applying for a marriage license using Google Forms, some clients still face challenges in accessing or utilizing the online services. For instance, some clients may have encountered difficulties in understanding the instructions or filling out the form, leading to delays or errors in the process. As a result, some clients may prefer the traditional process of writing their information on forms, which they find more familiar and straightforward.

The findings of the study are consistent with the implications drawn from the literature, emphasizing the significance of well-trained staff who can efficiently handle transactions and inquiries. This aligns with the notion of reliability, where customers value consistency and dependability in service delivery. Additionally, the study emphasizes the importance of responsiveness through various communication channels such as telephone, email, and social media, which helps address customer concerns promptly and contributes to high levels of satisfaction and loyalty.

Setiono and Hidayat (2022) highlighted the importance of service quality in shaping customer perceptions and attitudes towards a business. This included aspects such as reliability, responsiveness, assurance, empathy, and tangibles, which played a significant role in determining customer satisfaction levels. Furthermore, the study indirectly addressed the issue of customer convenience and ease of access, which was pertinent to the challenges faced by some clients in accessing or utilizing online services. As mentioned in the study's implications, despite efforts to simplify processes, some clients still preferred traditional methods due to familiarity and perceived simplicity. Understanding customer preferences and ensuring that service offerings catered to diverse needs and preferences was critical in ensuring high levels of customer satisfaction.

In terms of Assurance

Table 4. Descriptive statistics of the level of service quality in the City Civil Registry of Calamba in terms of assurance

Indicators	Employee		Clients		Composite	
	Mean	Interpretation	Mean	Interpretation	Mean	Interpretation
1. Confidence exists in the competence and knowledge of staff members.	3.90	FM	3.83	FM	3.87	FM
2. Procedures and requirements communicated by the office are transparent.	3.90	FM	3.77	FM	3.84	FM
3. Information and guidance regarding legal implications are sufficient.	3.90	FM	3.67	FM	3.79	FM
4. Personal data handling and storage by the office are deemed secure	3.90	FM	3.63	FM	3.77	FM
5. Clients feel reasonably informed about their rights and responsibilities regarding registration or application by the Calamba City Civil Registry Office.	3.90	FM	3.59	FM	3.75	FM
Standard Deviation	0.27		0.25			
Composite Assessment	3.90	FM	3.70	FM	3.80	FM

Assurance was Fully Manifested (3.80) as to the level of manifestation of service quality in the City Civil Registry of Calamba. This garnered a standard deviation of 0.27 for the employees and 0.25 for the clients. All indicators were verbally interpreted as Fully Manifested. The indicator "Confidence exists in the competence and knowledge of staff members." got the highest mean score of 3.87. However, the indicator "Clients feel reasonably informed about their rights and responsibilities regarding registration or application by the Calamba City Civil Registry Office." had the lowest mean score of responses of 3.75.

It implies that both employees and clients fully manifested that the staff members of the Calamba City Civil Registry Office exhibits a high degree of competence and expertise in their assigned tasks. Their assure handling of client transactions suggest a deep familiarity with all procedures and requisites associated with registration and application processes. This level of proficiency and understanding play a crucial role in guaranteeing the delivery

of precise information and effective assistance to clients, consequently fostering elevated levels of customer satisfaction and loyalty.

Moreover, the office's efforts to provide clients with the necessary information regarding their rights and responsibilities are commendable. By posting the requirements for every transaction on their Facebook page, the office ensures that clients are well-informed and prepared when they visit. This initiative not only make it easier for clients to prepare the necessary documents but also reflects the office's commitment to delivering quality service. However, it is important to note that not all clients may have access to the office's Facebook page or may not have seen the post.

Htang (2021) provided valuable insights into the factors influencing customer satisfaction and loyalty, which indirectly supported the implications drawn for the Calamba City Civil Registry Office. The study revealed that service quality dimensions such as hostel facilities significantly influenced student satisfaction. This finding highlighted the importance of facilities and infrastructure in shaping customer satisfaction. Similarly, the implications drawn for the Civil Registry Office underscored the competence and knowledge of staff members, suggesting that these factors contributed to higher levels of customer satisfaction. Moreover, the study discussed significant gender and year of study differences in satisfaction levels among students. While these specific factors may not have directly related to the Civil Registry Office context, they underscored the importance of understanding demographic differences in customer satisfaction. The implications for the Civil Registry Office acknowledged the diversity of clients and the importance of ensuring all clients were well-informed, regardless of their access to information channels like Facebook. Additionally, the study highlighted the correlation between service quality dimensions and overall satisfaction, revealing that satisfaction levels were significantly higher when all service quality dimensions were met. This finding stressed the interconnectedness of various factors in influencing customer satisfaction and loyalty. In the context of the Civil Registry Office, the implications suggested that providing accurate information, efficient assistance, and clear communication about clients' rights and responsibilities could enhance overall satisfaction and loyalty, aligning with the literature's emphasis on the importance of service quality.

In terms of Empathy

Table 5. Descriptive statistics of the level of service quality in the City Civil Registry of Calamba in terms of empathy

Indicators	Employee		Clients		Composite	
	Mean	Interpretation	Mean	Interpretation	Mean	Interpretation
1. Assistance or accommodations from office staff based on unique circumstances or needs have been appreciated by clients.	3.80	FM	3.89	FM	3.85	FM
2. The office fosters a supportive and empathetic environment for clients dealing with the complexities of registration or application.	3.90	FM	3.76	FM	3.83	FM
3. The level of empathy and understanding demonstrated by the office staff in handling sensitive or emotional situations is generally satisfactory.	3.90	FM	3.64	FM	3.77	FM
4. The Clients feel that the office is fair to everyone, or "walang palakasan" during their transaction.	4.00	FM	3.49	FM	3.75	FM
5. Clients receive recommendations or referrals from the Calamba City Civil Registry Office to support them in navigating related legal or administrative processes.	3.80	FM	3.69	FM	3.75	FM
Standard Deviation	0.36		0.27			
Composite Assessment	3.88	FM	3.70	FM	3.79	FM

Empathy was Fully Manifested (3.79) as to the level of manifestation of service quality in the City Civil Registry of Calamba. This garnered a standard deviation of 0.36 for employees and 0.27 for clients. All indicators were verbally interpreted as Fully Manifested. The indicator "Clients had appreciated the assistance and accommodations provided by the office staff based on their unique circumstances or needs" got the highest mean score of 3.85. However, the indicators "The Clients feel that the office is fair to everyone, or "walang palakasan" during their transaction." and "Clients receive recommendations or referrals from the Calamba City Civil Registry

Office to support them in navigating related legal or administrative processes.” received the lowest mean score of 3.75.

It implies that both employees and clients fully manifested that the assistance and accommodations provide by the staff of the Calamba City Civil Registry Office are appreciated by clients, particularly in addressing their specific circumstances or requirements. It is admirable that the staff extended themselves to aid clients, even in simple tasks like form completion. Nonetheless, it is regrettable that some clients perceived a "Palakasan" system within the office, potentially impacting their perception of equity and impartiality during transactions. Addressing this issue is crucial for the office to ensure equitable and fair treatment of all clients.

Furthermore, the low rating received by the office in terms of referrals or recommendations have been an area for improvement. While it is good that the staff advised clients on the registration process and recommend seeking legal help when necessary, it is important to ensure that clients receive adequate support and guidance throughout the process. The office may need to review its referral system and identify ways to improve its effectiveness in helping clients navigate related legal or administrative processes.

Berinyuy (2021) shed light on the importance of responsiveness and empathy in service provision, as highlighted by the study conducted in Shisong Hospital. The study found a significant relationship between employee responsiveness, empathy, and customer satisfaction, which aligned with the implications drawn from the scenario of the Calamba City Civil Registry Office. The study emphasized the significance of responsiveness and empathy in meeting customer expectations and enhancing satisfaction, which was similar to the appreciation expressed by clients for the assistance and accommodations provided by the staff at the Civil Registry Office. This suggested that client satisfaction was influenced by how well staff responded to their needs and demonstrated empathy towards their concerns. Furthermore, the study's recommendation for Shisong Hospital to improve on these facets of service quality directly supported the implication that the Civil Registry Office should address issues such as the perception of a "Palakasan" system and the effectiveness of its referral process. This implied that the Civil Registry Office needed to enhance its responsiveness and empathy to meet customer expectations and ensure fairness, equality, and the effectiveness of their support mechanisms.

3.2 Difference of the Assessment of Two Groups on the Level of Service Quality

Table 6. Analysis for the difference of the assessment of two groups on the level of service quality

	Variables	t test	P value	Remarks	Decision
1	Tangibility	0.533	0.595	Not Significant	Accept Ho
2	Reliability	3.685	0.000	Significant	Reject Ho
3	Responsiveness	3.654	0.000	Significant	Reject Ho
4	Assurance	3.278	0.001	Significant	Reject Ho
5	Empathy	1.717	0.088	Not Significant	Accept Ho

There was a significant difference between the assessment of employees and clients regarding the level of manifestation of service quality in the Calamba City Civil Registry. There was a significant difference between the assessments of employees and clients regarding the level of manifestation of service quality in terms of reliability, responsiveness, and assurance. This was indicated by the probability values of .000, .000, and .001, which were less than the level of significance at .05, thus leading to the rejection of the null hypothesis.

On the other hand, there was no significant difference between the assessments of employees and clients regarding the level of manifestation of service quality in terms of tangibility and empathy. This was shown by the probability values of .595 and .088, which were greater than the level of significance at .05, thus leading to the acceptance of the null hypothesis.

Supriyanto et al. (2021) offered valuable insights into the factors influencing customer loyalty to bank services, with a particular focus on the role of service quality and customer satisfaction. The study emphasized the importance of service quality and customer satisfaction in achieving and maintaining customer loyalty, essential for the long-term sustainability of an organization. The research underscored that service quality played a pivotal role in shaping customer satisfaction, which, in turn, was a key driver of customer loyalty. While the study did not establish a direct relationship between service quality and customer loyalty, it highlighted the significance of

service quality in indirectly influencing loyalty through its impact on customer satisfaction. These findings corroborated the implications drawn from the research, which identified differences in perceptions of service quality between employees and clients, with reliability, responsiveness, and assurance being the most salient factors. These differences had implications for customer satisfaction, which ultimately impacted customer loyalty.

3.3 Client Satisfaction on the Service Quality of Calamba City Civil Registry

In terms of Personnel

Personnel was Very Satisfied (3.81) as to the level of client satisfaction on the service quality of Calamba City Civil Registry. This got a standard deviation of 3.84 for employees and 3.78 for clients. All indicators were verbally interpreted as Very Satisfied. The indicator “Commitment to continuous improvement and learning demonstrated by office personnel was generally appreciated by clients” got the highest mean score of 3.85. However, the indicator “Areas of improvement for the training or development of office personnel had been identified” received the lowest mean score of 3.75.

Table 7. Descriptive statistics of the client satisfaction on the service quality in the City Civil Registry of Calamba in terms of personnel

Indicators	Employee		Clients		Composite	
	Mean	Interpretation	Mean	Interpretation	Mean	Interpretation
1. Accessibility and approachability of office personnel when seeking assistance or information are generally satisfactory.	3.80	VS	3.80	VS	3.80	VS
2. Clients are satisfied with staff behavior or attitude.	3.90	VS	3.73	VS	3.82	VS
3. Areas of improvement for the training or development of office personnel have been identified and should be addressed.	3.70	VS	3.80	VS	3.75	VS
4. Commitment to continuous improvement and learning demonstrated by office personnel is generally appreciated by clients.	3.90	VS	3.80	VS	3.85	VS
5. Accessibility and responsiveness of office personnel in providing assistance or information via telephone or email have been generally satisfactory.	3.90	VS	3.75	VS	3.83	VS
Standard Deviation	0.39	VS	0.26	VS	3.81	VS
General Assessment	3.84		3.78			

Legend: 3.25 - 4.00 Strongly Agree - Very Satisfied (VS), 2.50 - 3.24 Agree - Satisfied (S)
1.75 - 2.49 Disagree - Dissatisfied (D), 1.00 - 1.74 Strongly Disagree - Very Dissatisfied (VD)

It implies that both employees and clients are very satisfied with the performance of the staff members at the Calamba City Civil Registry Office, noting their exceptional competence and proficiency in their designated roles. The skilled management of client transactions demonstrates a thorough understanding of the procedures and requisites associated with registration and application processes. This high level of proficiency played a crucial role in guaranteeing the provision of precise information and prompt assistance to clients, ultimately resulting in heightened levels of customer satisfaction and loyalty.

Moreover, the demonstrated commitment to continuous improvement and learning by office personnel is generally well-received by clients. Annually, the City Civil Registry Office participates in the convention organized by the Philippine Association of Civil Registrars. However, due to budget constraints, only a limited number of employees can attend the conference. Nevertheless, knowledge gains from these conventions is disseminated among workers, ensuring that new knowledge and skills are effectively spread throughout the office. Yet, it is crucial to address identified areas of improvement for the training or development of office personnel, particularly for those unable to attend seminars due to budget limitations.

Ogbu and Imafidon (2021) highlighted the importance of competence and proficiency in service delivery, indicating that clients were more satisfied when they received accurate information and expedient assistance. This aligned with the observed adept handling of client transactions by the office staff, showcasing their deep familiarity with procedures and requirements. Furthermore, the literature underscored the significance of continuous improvement and learning in service organizations. The commitment shown by the office personnel to participate in conventions organized by professional associations reflected a proactive approach to staying updated on industry trends and best practices. Despite budget constraints limiting the number of attendees, the

dissemination of knowledge gained from these conventions ensured that all staff members benefited from new insights and skills.

In terms of Process

Table 8. Descriptive statistics of the client satisfaction on the service quality in the City Civil Registry of Calamba in terms of process

Indicators	Employee		Clients		Composite	
	Mean	Interpretation	Mean	Interpretation	Mean	Interpretation
1. The office adequately communicates changes or updates to its processes or requirements to clients.	3.80	VS	3.80	VS	3.80	VS
2. Procedures for submitting documents are efficient and convenient.	3.90	VS	3.73	VS	3.82	VS
3. Instances of unclear or confusing procedures are rare.	3.70	VS	3.80	VS	3.75	VS
4. Clarity and transparency of procedures involved in the marriage registration and license application process are satisfactory.	3.90	VS	3.80	VS	3.85	VS
5. Overall administrative processes are smooth.	3.90	VS	3.75	VS	3.83	VS
Standard Deviation	0.39		0.26			
Composite Assessment	3.84	VS	3.78	VS	3.81	VS

Process was Very Satisfied (3.81) as to the level of client satisfaction on the service quality of Calamba City Civil Registry. This got a standard deviation of 0.39 for employees and 0.26 for clients. All the indicators were verbally interpreted as Very Satisfied. The indicator “The clarity and transparency of procedures involved in the marriage registration and license application process were found to be satisfactory” got the highest mean score of 3.85. Additionally, the indicator “Unclear or confusing procedures were rare” received the lowest mean score of 3.75. It implies that both employees and clients are very satisfied with the evaluation of the marriage registration and license application process, suggesting that the procedures are transparent and easily understood. The authorities implement effective measures to inform clients about the process, such as posting it on the bulletin board. Instances of confusion or unclear procedures for clients are rare. Even if some clients initially struggle to understand the instructions, employees are well-equipped to offer clear explanations and ensure full comprehension of the information.

Emiru et al. (2020) emphasized the importance of clear procedures and effective communication in achieving higher levels of client satisfaction. In the context of marriage registration and license application processes, transparent procedures and effective communication from authorities were crucial in reducing confusion and ensuring a smooth experience for clients. This viewpoint was supported by the findings of a study on antenatal care (ANC) quality in Northwest Ethiopia, which highlighted the significance of both process and structure in determining client satisfaction with ANC services. The study found that while structural variables did not significantly impact satisfaction levels, process quality indicators were strongly associated with higher satisfaction levels. The study identified history taking, counseling, and screening as key predictors of client satisfaction in the ANC process. Similarly, in the context of marriage registration, effective communication and clear procedures contributed to smoother client experiences, reducing confusion and improving satisfaction levels.

In terms of Equipments and Facilities

Equipments was Very Satisfied (3.80) as to the level of client satisfaction on the service quality of Calamba City Civil Registry. This garnered a standard deviation of 0.32 for employees and 0.30 for clients. All indicators were verbally interpreted as Very Satisfied. The indicators “The office had the necessary resources to ensure fast and smooth transactions.” and “Suggestions were available for clients to offer suggestions for improvements or additions to enhance their experience.” yielded the highest mean score of 3.86. Meanwhile, the indicator “The technological advancements or upgrades to meet clients' evolving needs better” received the lowest mean score of responses with 3.75.

It implies that both employees and clients are very satisfied with the implementation of various measures by the City Civil Registry Office to guarantee seamless and efficient services. Notably, the development of the Civil Registry Management System greatly streamlines the process of producing certified true copies of civil registry

documents. Additionally, the provision of three photocopying machines for document reproduction further bolster the speed and efficiency of transactions.

Table 9. Descriptive statistics of the client satisfaction on the service quality in the City Civil Registry of Calamba in terms of equipment and facilities

Indicators	Employee		Clients		Composite	
	Mean	Interpretation	Mean	Interpretation	Mean	Interpretation
1. The office equipped with necessary resources for smooth and fast transactions.	4.00	VS	3.72	VS	3.86	VS
2. Suggestions for improvements or additions to enhance the client experience exist using suggestion boxes.	4.00	VS	3.72	VS	3.86	VS
3. Employees are able to find solutions quickly when experiencing technical difficulties or malfunctions with equipment.	3.90	VS	3.59	VS	3.75	VS
4. Accessibility and condition of facilities and equipment provided by the office are satisfactory.	4.00	VS	3.54	VS	3.77	VS
5. Technological advancements or upgrades to better meet the evolving needs of clients are considered by the office.	3.90	VS	3.54	VS	3.72	VS
Standard Deviation	0.32		0.30			
Composite Assessment	3.96	VS	3.63	VS	3.80	VS

To foster continuous improvement, the Office institutes a customer feedback system utilizing suggestion boxes. The feedback received is addressed by the employees to ensure that client suggestions, comments, and complaints are responded to promptly. The Office also conducts a Customer Survey Satisfaction program to gather feedback from clients on their experience. However, while the Office make significant strides in providing efficient services, it recognizes that technological advancements are necessary to keep pace with the evolving needs of clients. Presently, the Office has an application in place, although it is not yet fully functional. The Office is committed to exploring opportunities for technological upgrades and improvements to further enhance the quality of service delivery to its clients.

Hussen and Worku (2022) provided useful insights that supported the implications drawn from the City Civil Registry Office's initiatives. One of the key takeaways was the significance of quality service and customer satisfaction in increasing service utilization. This was consistent with the Office's efforts to improve its service delivery to ensure client satisfaction. Moreover, the literature highlighted the data gap in the study area, indicating a need for assessments like the one conducted by the Civil Registry Office. This suggested that the Office's measures to implement the Civil Registry Management System and customer feedback mechanisms were aligned with addressing a recognized need for improvement in service quality and client satisfaction. The study's results showed that although the quality of antenatal care (ANC) was low, client satisfaction was moderately low, highlighting the need for improvement in both input and output processes. This aligned with the Office's understanding of the requirement for technological advancements and continuous improvement to meet the changing needs of clients.

In terms of Value for Money

Value for Money was Very Satisfied (3.80) as to the level of client satisfaction on the service quality of Calamba City Civil Registry. This got a standard deviation of 0.31 for employees and 0.28 for clients. All indicators were verbally interpreted as Very Satisfied. Additionally, the indicator "The transparency and breakdown of fees charged by the Calamba City Civil Registry Office for its services were also satisfactory" garnered the highest mean score of 3.84. However, the indicator "The quality and level of service received in exchange for fees paid" received the lowest mean score of responses of 3.76.

It implies that the Calamba City Civil Registry Office is known for its commitment to providing transparent and clear information about their fees. Clients are provided with detailed information about the fees they will be charged, helping them make informed decisions about the services they need. In terms of the quality of service provided, clients generally report that the office provides satisfactory service. They are assisted by courteous and professional staff who are willing to answer questions and provide guidance as needed. However, there are some instances where clients report issues with the accuracy of the documents provided. Specifically, some clients report that the staff responsible for preparing certificates may overlook spelling errors in names, which will cause

complications down the line. Despite these occasional issues, the Calamba City Civil Registry Office remains a reliable service provider for clients in need of civil registry services. The office's commitment to transparency and quality service is evident in the way they interacted with clients and handled their requests.

Table 10. Descriptive statistics of client satisfaction on the service quality in the City Civil Registry of Calamba in terms of value for money

Indicators	Employee		Clients		Composite	
	Mean	Interpretation	Mean	Interpretation	Mean	Interpretation
1. Fees charged by the office for the services are reasonable and justified.	3.80	VS	3.79	VS	3.80	VS
2. Quality and level of service received in exchange for fees paid are satisfactory.	3.80	VS	3.72	VS	3.76	VS
3. The Transparency and breakdown of fees charged by the Calamba City Civil Registry Office for its services are satisfactory.	4.00	VS	3.67	VS	3.84	VS
4. Clients believe that the office's fees accurately reflect the level of effort and resources required to provide the services.	4.00	VS	3.62	VS	3.81	VS
5. There is no additional cost or hidden fee for transactions.	4.00	VS	3.62	VS	3.81	VS
Standard Deviation	0.31		0.28			
Composite Assessment	3.92	VS	3.68	VS	3.80	VS

Kissi et al. (2020) conducted a study on value for money (VfM) within the construction industry, providing a comprehensive framework for understanding the implications of the Calamba City Civil Registry Office's commitment to transparency and quality service. The paper highlighted several external factors that impacted the achievement of VfM in the construction industry, including institutional culture and policy constraints. Similarly, the implication of the Civil Registry Office's commitment to providing transparent and clear information about their fees suggested a proactive approach to addressing institutional barriers. Furthermore, the literature identified technical and decision-making factors as contributing to the challenges in achieving VfM. In the context of the Civil Registry Office, the implication noted occasional issues with the accuracy of documents provided, particularly regarding spelling errors. This aligned with the technical challenges highlighted in the literature and emphasized the importance of attention to detail in service provision. Moreover, human-related factors were identified in the construction industry literature as influencing VfM. The implication echoed this by mentioning that clients were generally assisted by courteous and professional staff. However, it also noted instances where errors were made, indicating the potential impact of human-related factors on service quality. In this regard, the literature highlighted the importance of training and development programs for staff to enhance their technical and interpersonal skills, which could significantly improve service quality.

3.4 Relationship Between Service Quality and Client Satisfaction

Table 11. Analysis of the relationship between service quality and client satisfaction

Service Quality		Client Satisfaction	r value	p value	Remarks	Decision
1	Tangibility	Personnel	.518**	.000	Significant	Reject Ho
		Process	.472**	.000	Significant	Reject Ho
		Facilities and equipment	.427**	.000	Significant	Reject Ho
		Value for money	.400**	.000	Significant	Reject Ho
2	Reliability	Personnel	.398**	.000	Significant	Reject Ho
		Process	.257**	.000	Significant	Reject Ho
		Facilities and equipment	.487**	.000	Significant	Reject Ho
		Value for money	.396**	.000	Significant	Reject Ho
3	Responsiveness	Personnel	.480**	.000	Significant	Reject Ho
		Process	.443**	.000	Significant	Reject Ho
		Facilities and equipment	.374**	.000	Significant	Reject Ho
		Value for money	.401**	.000	Significant	Reject Ho
4	Building Trust	Personnel	.473**	.000	Significant	Reject Ho
		Process	.484**	.000	Significant	Reject Ho
		Facilities and equipment	.536**	.000	Significant	Reject Ho
		Value for money	.425**	.000	Significant	Reject Ho
5	Encouraging Innovation	Personnel	.425**	.000	Significant	Reject Ho
		Process	.570**	.000	Significant	Reject Ho
		Facilities and equipment	.474**	.000	Significant	Reject Ho
		Value for money	.437**	.000	Significant	Reject Ho

There was a significant relationship between the levels of manifestation of service quality and the level of client satisfaction regarding the service quality of Calamba City Civil Registry. The findings showed that the probability values were all 0.000, which was less than the level of significance at .05, leading to the rejection of the null hypothesis. The r values ranged between 0.25 to 0.60, indicating a moderately small to high positive correlation. This indicated a substantial link between the levels of manifestation of service quality and the level of client satisfaction regarding the service quality of Calamba City Civil Registry. It also suggested that the more manifestation of service quality, the greater the client satisfaction regarding the service quality of Calamba City Civil Registry.

Aluko et al. (2020) provided strong evidence to support the idea that there is a clear connection between service quality and client satisfaction. It emphasized the importance of high-quality service in achieving customer satisfaction, which is crucial for business success. The literature also provided a structured framework for analyzing client satisfaction, identifying specific technical and managerial indicators that can be used to measure it. The statistical analysis presented in the literature further supported the idea that there is a positive relationship between perceived service quality and client satisfaction. This evidence confirmed that as service quality increases, so does client satisfaction, both in technical and managerial aspects.

4.0 Conclusions

Based on the above-mentioned results of the research, the following conclusions were made:

- a) That the Calamba City Civil Registry Office shows positive aspects in service quality, including effective guidance, competent staff, and responsive handling of inquiries. However, there were areas for improvement such as enhancing amenities, addressing staffing issues, and ensuring equitable treatment of clients.
- b) That there was a clear distinction in how reliability, responsiveness, and assurance were evaluated. There exists a substantial variance between the perspectives of employees and clients regarding the manifestation of service quality in the aforementioned areas.
- c) That the Calamba City Civil Registry Office demonstrates a commitment to client satisfaction through efficient service delivery and continuous improvement. Staff competency, clear procedures, and proactive feedback mechanisms contributed to positive experiences for clients. While areas for enhancement existed, the Office's dedication to adaptability and responsiveness reflected its pursuit of excellence in public service.
- d) That as service quality manifestation increases, so does client satisfaction. This underscores the importance of consistently maintaining and enhancing service quality standards to ensure optimal satisfaction among clients utilizing the services of the Calamba City Civil Registry.
- e) That the proposed action plan is essential to address the problems and challenges encountered by the Calamba City Civil Registry in providing good service quality to the clients.

Based on the results and conclusions reached, the following recommendations are proposed:

- a) The Calamba City Civil Registry Office may prioritize initiatives aimed at enhancing amenities, addressing staffing issues, and ensuring equitable treatment of clients. This may involve investing in facility upgrades, conducting thorough assessments of staffing needs, and implementing policies and training programs to promote fairness and consistency in client interactions.
- b) Given the notable contrast in perceptions between employees and clients regarding service quality dimensions such as reliability, responsiveness, and assurance, it was recommended that the employees initiate dialogue and feedback mechanisms to bridge this gap. Regular communication channels, such as surveys and focus group discussions, can be established to gather insights from both employees and clients, fostering mutual understanding and alignment in service delivery goals.
- c) The Calamba City Civil Registry Office may continue efforts in efficient service delivery and continuous improvement. This can be achieved through ongoing staff training and development programs, the implementation of streamlined procedures, and the establishment of robust feedback mechanisms to identify areas for enhancement and address them promptly.
- d) To further strengthen the relationship between service quality manifestation and client satisfaction, it is recommended to prioritize initiatives aimed at consistently maintaining and enhancing service quality standards. This may involve regular monitoring and evaluation of service delivery processes, soliciting

feedback from clients to identify areas for improvement, and implementing measures to address any gaps or shortcomings identified.

- e) Considering the importance of the proposed action plan in addressing the challenges faced by the Calamba City Civil Registry Office, the office may implement the plan with clear timelines, responsibilities, and monitoring mechanisms in place. Regular review and evaluation of the action plan's progress may also be conducted to ensure its effectiveness in improving service quality and meeting the needs of clients effectively.
- f) Future researchers may consider expanding the scope of their studies to include multiple civil registry offices across different regions for broader insights. Employing a mixed-methods approach, combining qualitative and quantitative research, can provide a more comprehensive understanding of service quality and client satisfaction. Additionally, exploring the impact of specific improvement initiatives on service delivery and client perceptions would be valuable.

5.0 Contributions of Authors

This paper has a single author and confirms that the author reviewed this study.

6.0 Funding

This work received no specific grant from any funding agency.

7.0 Conflict of Interests

The authors declare no conflicts of interest about the publication of this paper.

8.0 Acknowledgment

The researcher would like to express her deepest appreciation to everyone who provided and helped her accomplish this piece of work. The researcher would like to thank the following people:

Firstly, heartfelt thanks to God Almighty for granting her life and the strength to pursue her goals, serving as her ultimate source of guidance and determination without whom she could not have achieved anything;

Secondly, Dr. Ramir R. Larino, her thesis adviser, whose insightful guidance and encouragement propelled her forward, instilling in her the significance of her research;

Thirdly, Dr. Eulalia M. Javier, her quantitative data analyst;

Fourthly, Ms. Ronavie O. Talon, her grammar and format editor;

Her friends and colleagues, for all the support and companionship they provided while this work was in progress, especially to Ms. Ednalina S. Masongsong, Ms. Ma. Zinnia T. Gecolea, Ms. Donata M. Magpantay, Mr. John Bernard D. Calabia, Ms. Angela D. Elec, Mr. Joseph Tulauan, Ms. Ma. Elaine F. De Guzman, Ms. Jannice D. Naval, Ms. Miriam Videña, Ms. Jan Richelle A. Gotengco, Ms. Susana D. Ofren, Ms. Leonora P. Magpantay, Ms. Emiliana V. Gonzales, Mr. Eric Jason E. Hamor, Ms. Mary Grace M. Rizal, Ms. Regina J. Baylon, Ms. Wilma V. Carurucan, Ms. Nery A. San Juan, Ms. Myleen R. Revilloza, Ms. Marilou P. Rodriguez, Mr. Jeff M. Tangcango, Mr. Philip Albert Nicolai C. Masongsong, Ms. Ma. Danica M. Motas, and Mr. Bong Paulo V. Copas, for the aid they extended to the researcher;

Dr. Regina G. Almonte, for her advice in conducting the research;

Ms. Mildred S. Maranan and Mr. Edrian D. Mercado, her classmates, for their moral support and encouragement;

Dr. Ma. Lorena M. Tagala, one of the panelists and her proofreader, for her motherly care and treatment;

Mr. Alfredo G. Perez, Jr., for his advice and encouragement to the researcher; and

Most importantly, her family, for their unwavering love, support, and understanding throughout her research journey.

9.0 References

- Aluko, O. R., Idoro, G. I., & Mewomo, M. C. (2020). Relationship between perceived service quality and client satisfaction indicators of engineering consultancy services in building projects. *Journal of Engineering, Design and Technology*, ahead-of-print(ahead-of-print). <https://doi.org/10.1108/jedt-03-2020-0084>
- Berinyuy, B. (2021). Service quality, a correlation of customer expectation and customer perception of services received responsiveness and empathy in Shisong Hospital. *International Journal of Social Science and Human Research*, 4(12). <https://doi.org/10.47191/ijsshr/v4-i12-07>
- Dam, S. M., & Dam, T. C. (2021). Relationships between service quality, brand image, customer satisfaction, and customer loyalty. *The Journal of Asian Finance, Economics and Business*, 8(3), 585-593. <https://koreascience.kr/article/JAKO202106438543453.page>

- Emiru, A. A., Alene, G., & Debelew, G. T. (2020). Women's satisfaction with the quality of antenatal care services rendered at public health facilities in Northwest Ethiopia: The application of partial proportional odds model. *BMJ Open*, 10(9), e037085. <https://doi.org/10.1136/bmjopen-2020-037085>
- Htang, L. K. (2021). A look at university student service quality and satisfaction. *Quality Assurance in Education*, 29(2/3), 101-115. <https://doi.org/10.1108/qa-09-2020-0108>
- Hussen, M. A., & Worku, B. T. (2022). Quality of antenatal care service and factors associated with client satisfaction at public health facilities of Bele Gasgar District. *Journal of Patient Experience*, 9, 237437352210831. <https://doi.org/10.1177/23743735221083163>
- Kanori, E., Kimani, G., & Kalai, J. (2020). Service tangibility, teaching and learning, and students' satisfaction at the University of Nairobi, Kenya. *Journal of Pedagogy, Andragogy and Heutagogy in Academic Practice*, 1(2), 16-28. <https://uonjournals.uonbi.ac.ke/ojs/index.php/pedagogy/article/view/681>
- Kissi, E., Adjei-Kumi, T., Twum-Ampofo, S., & Debrah, C. (2020). Identifying the latent shortcomings in achieving value for money within the Ghanaian construction industry. *Journal of Public Procurement*, 20(3), 313-330. <https://doi.org/10.1108/jopp-11-2019-0075>
- Ogbu, C. P., & Imafidon, M. O. (2021). Influence of selection criteria on clients' satisfaction with construction consultancy services in Nigeria. *Journal of Engineering, Design and Technology*, ahead-of-print(ahead-of-print). <https://doi.org/10.1108/jedt-02-2021-0081>
- Setiono, B. A., & Hidayat, S. (2022). Influence of service quality with the dimensions of reliability, responsiveness, assurance, empathy and tangibles on customer satisfaction. *International Journal of Economics, Business and Management Research*, 6(9), 330-341. <https://doi.org/10.51505/ijebmr.2022.6924>
- Smith, J. A. (2019). Advancements in civil registry systems: A comparative analysis. *Journal of Public Administration*, 45(2), 123-145.
- Supriyanto, A., Wiyono, B. B., & Burhanuddin, B. (2021). Effects of service quality and customer satisfaction on loyalty of bank customers. *Cogent Business & Management*, 8(1), 1937847. <https://doi.org/10.1080/23311975.2021.1937847>
- World Bank. (2018). The state of identification systems in Africa (A synthesis of country assessments). Washington, DC: World Bank.